

CITY OF COLUMBIA

CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD 2016 ANNUAL REPORT

Table of Contents

Membership Information 1

History of Formation of the Citizens Police Review Board2

Executive Summary of Accomplishments3

Summary of Appeals.....4

Demographic Information on Complainants who Appealed to the
Citizens Police Review Board 7

Analysis of Citizen and Police Complaints and Compliments7

Community Outreach and Educational Programs8

Conclusion9

2016 CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD MEMBERS
(as of December 31, 2016)

Darryl Smith, Chair

(appointed March 2015; Chair – November 2016 to present)

Andrew Fisher, Vice Chair

(appointed September 2013, Vice Chair - November 2, 2015 to present)

Gabriel Scott Dean

(appointed September 2010 to present, Vice Chair - January 1, 2015 to November 1, 2015)

Val R. DeBrunce

(appointed November 2015)

Renee Henson

(appointed December 2015)

Alan Meyer

(appointed March 2015)

Stephen Sheltmire

(appointed February 2011)

Cornellia Williams

(appointed November 2016)

Jayne Woods

(appointed October 2014)

Members who resigned or had their term expire during the year:

Dr. James C. Martin (*November 2009 to November 2016; Chair - August 2011 to November 2016 – term expired*).

Subcommittee Membership:

Mediation Task Force Subcommittee (Disbanded: January 13, 2016):

1. Scott Dean
2. Andrew Fisher

Outreach Subcommittee*:

1. Andrew Fisher
2. Steve Sheltmire
3. Jayne Woods
4. Renee Henson

**Also serving on the subcommittee during the year was: James Martin (term expired November 2016).*

Strategic Planning Subcommittee (Created: January 13, 2016):

1. Scott Dean
2. Val DeBrunce
3. Andrew Fisher
4. Alan Meyer
5. Jayne Woods

HISTORY OF THE FORMATION OF THE CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD

In 2007, a coalition of citizens and groups proposed the idea of creating a civilian review board to the City Council. The City Council appointed a fourteen member committee to study whether or not a review board was needed and to consider how such a board would be structured. The committee reviewed all complaints that existed before the professional standards unit was established. In addition, they studied and considered different models used by different cities, and hosted public events to gather input from the citizens. After extensive study and public input, the committee unanimously agreed to recommend that the City of Columbia establish a citizens police review board.

In July of 2009, the City Council of the City of Columbia, by adopting Ordinance No. 020331, created a nine member Citizens Police Review Board. The ordinance outlined the duties of the Citizens Police Review Board as follows:

The Citizens Police Review Board shall have the following duties:

- (1) Review appeals from the police chief's decisions on alleged police misconduct as provided for in this article.
- (2) Host public meetings and educational programs for Columbia residents and police officers.
- (3) Review and make recommendations to the police chief and city manager on police policies, procedures and training.
- (4) Prepare and submit to the city council annual reports that analyze citizen and police complaints including demographic data on complainants, complaint disposition, investigative findings and disciplinary actions. The reports should also describe the Board's community outreach and educational programs. The reports should also set forth any recommendations made on police policies, procedures and training. The reports shall be submitted no later than March 1 for the previous calendar year.

The City Council initially appointed the first eight members of the Citizens Police Review Board in November of 2009. Also in November of 2009, the Human Rights Commission appointed its first member to the Board. The Board met for the first time on November 18, 2009.

In 2014, the City Council, at the request of the Citizens Police Review Board, amended Section 21-49, to add additional duties. Under the most recent amendments to the ordinance, the Board is also to conduct a jurisdictional review from the decision by the police chief that a person's allegations do not fall within the requirements set forth in the article related to complaints. The Board is also to conduct audits or reviews of the records of the police department for compliance with the requirements of the ordinances.

In 2015, the City Council, at the request of the Citizens Police Review Board, amended Section 21-46 (d) to remove term limits.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This annual report includes information on the Citizens Police Review Board's work from January 2016 through the end of December 2016.

Pursuant to its mandate, the Citizens Police Review Board's accomplishments include:

- (1) The Board reviewed appeals from the police chief's decision on alleged police misconduct and conducted jurisdictional reviews of the police chief's decisions. During this reporting period, citizens requested that the Board review the police chief's decisions eleven (11) different times.
- (2) The Board hosted monthly public meetings with an opportunity for public comment at each regular monthly meeting, provided public educational programs on a variety of topics, and participated in community outreach. In addition, the Outreach Subcommittee met on February 10, 2016.
- (3) The Board met with the police chief on two occasions (May 11, 2016 and November 9, 2016).
- (4) The Board is submitting to the City Council the following annual report which outlines the Board's actions from January 1, 2016 through December 31, 2016.
- (5) The Board has trained volunteer advocates to assist complainants and police officers with the complaint and appeal process.
- (6) For the Board's mediation pilot program, the City of Columbia has a contract with local attorney and mediator Lorri Kline to provide mediation services. During this review period, the Board referred a case to mediation.
- (7) Three Board members Mr. Smith, Mr. Fisher, and Mr. Dean were sent to the National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement (NACOLE) national conference. Mr. Dean served as the City's voting member in the national organization.
- (8) Mr. Dean is a Certified Practitioner of Oversight (CPO) through NACOLE. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Sheltmire, and Mr. Smith are in the process of achieving CPO credentialing. Mr. Dean continues to serve on NACOLE's Website Committee.
- (9) Three board members rode along with on duty police officers. Darryl Smith completed a ride along with a police officer on September 9, 2016 from 6pm to midnight. On October 4, 2016, Andrew Fisher completed a ride along with a

police officer from 3 p.m. to 7 p.m. On November 5, 2016, Scott Dean completed a ride along with a police officer.

- (10) The Board continues to review educational, complaint, and supplemental material(s) and make changes where necessary, including creating additional resources when needed.
- (11) The Board established a strategic planning subcommittee in 2016. The Strategic Planning Subcommittee met on August 10, 2016, October 12, 2016, and on November 9, 2016. The subcommittee's work is ongoing, and it expects to deliver recommendations to council.
- (12) The Board established a complaint review process for those complaints lodged with the Columbia Police Department but not formally appealed to the Board.

SUMMARY OF APPEALS REVIEWED BY THE CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD

During this reporting period, the Board received eleven (11) appeals filed in 2016.

The dispositions of the cases are summarized below.

CPRB Case Number	Summary and Board's Action
2016-0001	A person filed an appeal on March 4, 2016. After its jurisdictional review, the Board determined that the case be referred to the Police Chief for investigation. Dr. Martin, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Mr. Fisher, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Ms. Henson, and Mr. Meyer voted in favor of the motion. Mr. Smith voted against the motion. In a letter dated May 9, 2016 the Police Chief responded to the CPRB that he was standing by his original findings that the allegation was not an allegation of misconduct. In a letter dated June 7, 2016 the Police Chief responded to the CPRB and included in his correspondence a finding that the complaint was unfounded. The complainant appealed this decision to the Board and it was assigned case number CPRB 2016-0004. For additional information on the complainant's second appeal, see below summary related to CPRB 2016-0004.
2016-0002	A person filed an appeal on May 4, 2016. After its independent review, the Board voted to uphold the Police Chief's decision. Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Mr. Fisher, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, and Ms. Henson voted in favor of the motion.

- 2016-0003 A person filed an appeal on June 21, 2016. After its jurisdictional review, the Board voted unanimously that they had standing to review the case. Mr. DeBrunce seconded the motion. Dr. Martin, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Mr. Fisher, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith and Mr. Meyer voted in favor of the motion. After its initial review, the Board voted unanimously to sustain the Police Chief's decision. Dr. Martin, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Mr. Fisher, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith and Mr. Meyer voted in favor of the motion.
- 2016-0004 A person filed an appeal on June 30, 2016. After its initial review, the Board voted on July 13, 2016 to send this case to mediation. Mr. Fisher, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith and Mr. Meyer voted in favor of the motion. Dr. Martin abstained. The mediator informed the Board that cases CPRB 2016-0001 and CPRB 2016-0004 were being returned to the Board because a party declined to participate in mediation. At the September 14, 2016 Citizens Police Review Board meeting, the Board passed a motion to agree with the police chief's decision on the complaint. The motion passed with Mr. Meyer, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, Ms. Woods, Mr. Fisher, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Henson, and Mr. Dean voted in favor of the motion. Mr. Martin voted against the motion.
- 2016-0005 A person filed an appeal on July 19, 2016. Mr. Smith made a motion to uphold the police chief's decision on the complaint. Mr. Meyer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with Mr. Meyer, Dr. Martin, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Mr. Fisher, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Ms. Henson and Mr. Smith voting in favor of the motion.
- 2016-0006 A person filed an appeal on July 19, 2016. After its jurisdictional review on September 14, 2016, the Board voted unanimously that they had standing to review the case. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, Ms. Henson, Mr. Meyer and Dr. Martin voted in favor of the motion. After its initial review, the Board voted to sustain the Police Chief's decision. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith,

Ms. Henson, Mr. Meyer and Dr. Martin voted in favor of the motion.

2016-0007

Two people filed an appeal on July 26, 2016. After its jurisdictional review on September 14, 2016, the Board voted unanimously that they had standing to review the case. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, Ms. Henson, Mr. Meyer and Dr. Martin voted in favor of the motion. After its initial review, the Board voted to sustain the Police Chief's decision. Mr. DeBrunce, Ms. Henson, Dr. Martin, Mr. Fisher, Mr. Smith voted in favor. Mr. Meyer and Ms. Woods abstained. Mr. Dean and Mr. Sheltmire voted against the motion.

2016-0008

A person filed an appeal on September 9, 2016. After its jurisdictional review on October 12, 2016, the Board voted unanimously that they had standing to review the case. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, Ms. Henson, Mr. Meyer and Dr. Martin voted in favor of the motion. After its initial review, the Board voted unanimously to sustain the Police Chief's decision. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, Ms. Henson, Mr. Meyer and Dr. Martin voted in favor of the motion.

2016-0009

A person filed an appeal on September 16, 2016. After its jurisdictional review on October 12, 2016, the Board unanimously voted that they had standing to review the case. . After its initial review, the Board voted unanimously with the Police Chief's decision for exonerating the officer on one allegation and further moved that the Board send back the Police Chief's determination that another allegation did not fall within the guidelines of officer misconduct. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, Ms. Henson, Mr. Meyer and Dr. Martin voted in favor of the motion. As to the Police Chief's third finding, the Board voted unanimously to uphold the chief's decision with respect to the finding that the person complained of was not an employee of CPD. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, Ms. Henson, Mr. Meyer and Dr. Martin voted in favor of the motion.

2016-0010 A person filed an appeal on September 19, 2016. After its jurisdictional review on October 12, 2016, the Board unanimously that they had standing to review the case. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, Ms. Henson, Mr. Meyer and Dr. Martin voted in favor of the motion. After its initial review, the Board voted unanimously with the Police Chief's decision. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, Mr. Sheltmire, Ms. Woods, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, Ms. Henson, Mr. Meyer and Dr. Martin voted in favor of the motion.

2016-0011 A person filed an appeal on December 27, 2016. It is still pending.

**DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION ON COMPLAINANTS WHO
APPEALED TO THE CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD**

CPRB Case Number	Demographic Information on Complainant
2016-0001	w/f
2016-0002	b/m
2016-0003	b/m
2016-0004	w/f
2016-0005	b/m
2016-0006	b/m
2016-0007	w/f and w/m
2016-0008	b/f
2016-0009	b/m
2016-0010	b/m
2016-0011	b/f

ANALYSIS OF CITIZEN AND POLICE COMPLAINTS AND COMPLIMENTS

At the time this report was prepared, the Board had not received a copy of the City of Columbia Police Department's 2016 Annual Report of the Internal Affairs Unit or its analysis of police and citizen complaints and compliments. When the Police Department provides the information and analysis of police and citizen's complaints and compliments to the Board, the Board will provide a supplemental report to the City Council.

COMMUNITY OUTREACH AND EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS
BY THE CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD

Section 21-49 of the City Code of Ordinances provides that the Citizens Police Review Board shall host public meetings and educational programs for Columbia residents and police officers. The Board regularly met with police recruits to provide the new recruits with information about civilian oversight. The Board also used other avenues to increase community awareness and hosted speakers on civilian review topics at public meetings.

Date	Topic
February 2, 2016	Jayne Woods met with a new recruit during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.
February 5, 2016	Darryl Smith met with Sgt. Baillargeon and Andre Cook.
February 10, 2016	Professor Bruce Bartholow, Psychologist at MU, presented on his research of implicit biases.
March 9, 2016	James Martin met with individuals from the St. Louis and the Kansas City area on Civilian Oversight.
April 2, 2016	Mr. Sheltmire, Mr. DeBrunce, Mr. Smith, and Ms. Henson attended Use of Force training provided by the Columbia Police Department.
April 4, 2016	Scott Dean and Rose Wibbenmeyer were on Community Connections radio show at KOPN.
May 4, 2016	Alan Meyer and Steve Sheltmire met with new recruits during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.
June 6, 2016	Steve Sheltmire, Darryl Smith, and Val DeBrunce met with new recruits during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.
July 13, 2016	Jerry East presented on Columbia Police Department Traffic Stop Data.
August 10, 2016	Lt Geoff Jones, Lt. Krista Shouse-Jones, Lt. Jason Jones, Lt. Eric Hughes, and Lt. Scott Young presented on 21 st Century Policing by the Columbia Police Department.

August 29, 2016	Darryl Smith and Val DeBrunce met with new recruits during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.
September 2016	Steve Sheltmire attended a community meeting at the Tribune.
October 2016	Val DeBrunce met with Officer Gooch and learned about fake identifications.
October 8, 2016	Scott Dean presented at Boy Scout University.
November 2, 2016	Scott Dean and Rose Wibbenmeyer presented to Professor Clark Peters' class.
November 5, 2016	Darryl Smith, Val DeBrunce, Steve Sheltmire and Andrew Fisher attended the Fair and Impartial Policing event.
November 2016	Steve Sheltmire attended a town hall meeting at the Columbia Tribune.
November 14, 2016	Darryl Smith attended the NACOLE – Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement: A Road to Building Community Trust conference in St. Louis, Missouri. The sessions he attended include: Effective Communication with Law Enforcement, De-escalation of Force by the Police, and Bias-Based Policing.

CONCLUSION

As evidenced by the information included in this report, the CPRB has continued to serve the citizens of Columbia.

The Board looks forward to continuing to execute its duties in 2017.