



# City of Columbia, Missouri

## Meeting Minutes

### Columbia Police Chief's Vehicle Stop Committee

---

Tuesday, July 9, 2019  
5:30 PM

City Hall - Conference  
Room 1A, 701 E.  
Broadway

---

#### I. CALL TO ORDER

**Present:** 7 - Andre Cook, Toni Dukes, Don Love, Eric Parsons, Dale Roberts, Jerome Sally and Tara Warne-Griggs

**Absent:** 3 - Robert Aulgur, Pamela Hardin and Matthew Nichols

#### II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA/REVISED AGENDA

Motion passed unanimously.

**Approve the agenda as submitted.**

**Yes:** 7 - Cook, Dukes, Love, Parsons, Roberts, Sally and Warne-Griggs

**Absent:** 3 - Aulgur, Hardin and Nichols

#### III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Committee's June 11, 2019 Draft Minutes

Motion passed unanimously.

**Accept the June 11, 2019 minutes as amended on pg. 2, first section, bullet no. 6 to replace "drive" with "driver."**

**Yes:** 7 - Cook, Dukes, Love, Parsons, Roberts, Sally and Warne-Griggs

**Absent:** 3 - Aulgur, Hardin and Nichols

#### IV. DATA PRESENTATION - ERIC PARSONS

## Milyo - Disparities Report

### Data Presentation - Eric Parsons

Eric shared an analysis using 2017 CPD vehicle stop data prepared by Dr. Jeff Milyo. This is the second of three presentations that will be offered by members of the Data Subcommittee. Eric recommended reviewing Dr. Milyo's whole report, shared earlier with all Committee members.

Eric - wants to focus on some key points - there is no single definitive way to determine over- or under-representation, but there are several approaches - questionable if Attorney General's disparity index is the best - Census data used by the AG's contracted analyst gets outdated over time - disparity for any group tends to decrease as the group's percentage of total population increases, but AG's index does not reflect an updated Census count

Census tends to undercount Blacks and also creates a disparity - if the number is too small, the disparity index looks higher - the measuring stick differs in various communities - AG's report does not normalize, so it's hard to compare across communities

- Don - see the AG's summary - an alternative to normalizing is to divide Black by White disparity index
- Eric - would have to go through the algebra
- Don - the algebra does work - aids comparison among jurisdictions - contractors [for the analysis] are following the law, not deciding on their own which numbers to use - AG could do more if he wanted to
- Dale - what is the St. Louis index (Eric: refer to previous slide)
- Don - looked at the Ferguson index before and after the Brown killing - thought there was a much higher stop disparity for Black drivers

Eric - index does not really address root causes of disparity - Milyo used three other methods in his analysis: veil of darkness; search hit rates; and marijuana legalization

For veil of darkness, you'd expect higher stop rates during the day because you can see the driver's race more easily than you can at night - can control for time of day and might control for seasonal differences - Milyo looked at inter-twilight - model controls for type of street

For hit rates, if search is based on race, you would expect lower hit rates if you're stopping all Black drivers - Columbia has high hit rates - officers know what they're looking for - a problem could be differing definitions for "contraband" - Black and White proportions are close for contraband but less so for weapons

Sample size affects statistical significance - Milyo is an economist who cuts data in many ways: by demographics, driving behavior at different times and reasons for stop - when you cut more, the sample is smaller and provides less reliable data

- Tara - do cops check if weapons are legal or not legal? (Eric: great question; Jerry - possibly anything that is taken into evidence)
- Don - should just be contraband - state regulations are vague
- Andre - doesn't think whether a weapon is legal is what the question tries to determine - can we get more data on this, and will it make a difference?
- Toni - are you trained to let an officer know if you have a weapon and Concealed Carry Weapon (CCW) permit?
- Dale - what do you mean by "illegal"?
- Eric - attempt to determine "legal"?

- Andre - officers have the ability to know if there's a CCW when they run a license - can have one if you're on a peaceful journey
- Don - data doesn't include that information - only 81 weapons in Columbia...stolen weapon or felon with a weapon
- Tara - is the efficiency of the hit rates justifiable?
- Don - there's a lot that would interest us that doesn't interest Jeff [Milyo]

Eric - Columbia has a low traffic stop rate - data indicate there is limited scope in bias among specific officers, on average - if so, what's the cause? Given where differences are, it doesn't look like disparity is based on where they're located - who determines where they are during the day?

- Tara - officers are sent to where the calls are - concentrated but may inadvertently pull people over unnecessarily - "systemic racism"
- Dale - areas where officers don't patrol
- Toni - plans to ask officers about assignments to sectors - cars that patrol...same people are there continually - need to know how they're policing - define "reasonable suspicion," because it seems ambiguous and there is officer discretion - we need that piece after our presentations are complete
- Tara - referred members to CPRB video on Youtube, where board members discussed this issue
- Toni - knows officers and sheriffs will be in hot spots and may look for people who don't belong there - her presence in Thornbrook, for example
- Dale - notes courts have ruled that high crime areas justify the presence of officers
- Jerome - CPD is under-staffed and can't patrol all areas
- Andre - the priority calls hit first
- Don - bias-free policing policy goes in this direction - it was adopted last year - when is it appropriate to stop a Black driver in a White neighborhood just due to race? The answer should be, "Never"

Eric - refers to table 2.8 in Milyo study - veil of darkness - shows data by beats, and Thornborok is beat 60

- Don - officers were told they could ask for consent any time, then were told to be more careful, then less so - it's not so much the officers as the orders they're getting - supervisors need to pay more attention to when consent is sought and to justify the direction the officer wants to go
- Jerome - interested in data by beat - if you're in a hot spot, there is disparity
- Don - if the community agrees on no tolerance, not a problem [to police hot spots] - or is there an alternative to avoid all stops? The overwhelming problem isn't that cops hate Blacks, it's the procedures - Milyo conclusion is dependable but doesn't look at data deeply enough - investigative stops may be important - doesn't think officers are always checking them off
- Andre - may be looking for a subject and a vehicle or person seems to match - maybe not probable cause to stop, but use it to make a determination, continue investigating - if not, investigation should end - or, there may be a trend where there's a high probability of shootings between x and y - may stop cars more frequently, looking for weapons to reduce numbers - may or may not make probable cause - officer may have prior knowledge or some basis to stop a car and help fill in the blanks
- Don - can look for a minor violation and do an investigation where less is known - other circumstances contribute - if we know that, could explain a disproportion
- Jerry - special operations were supposed to limit that
- Toni - are saturations part of the data? (Jerry: yes) - we need to have a clear

understanding of probable cause and reasonable suspicion - that's why she'll ask officers for a presentation

## V. GENERAL COMMENTS BY PUBLIC, MEMBERS AND STAFF

- Chad McLaurin - in saturation policing, are they working off old information that leads to hot spots - the past informs the future - questions legitimacy
- Lynn Maloney - asked the Interim Chief why he's not emphasizing requests for consent - he said officers were losing cards, it was hard to get data - makes a difference in data collection but not officer behavior - CPD is changing the data collection system
- Andre - consent card is not a policy now - body cams record interactions

## VI. NEXT MEETING DATE - AUGUST 13, 2019

## VII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion passed unanimously.

### Move to adjourn.

**Yes:** 7 - Cook, Dukes, Love, Parsons, Roberts, Sally and Warne-Griggs

**Absent:** 3 - Aulgur, Hardin and Nichols

Members of the public may attend any open meeting. For requests for accommodations related to disability, please call 573-874-CITY (573-874-2489) or email CITY@CoMo.gov. In order to assist staff in making the appropriate arrangements for your accommodation, please make your request as far in advance of the posted meeting date as possible.