City of Columbia Water and Light
Option A vs. Option B
Route Selection Matrix

	Public Feedback Ranking	Importance Factor (See Note)	Summary (Option B-2)				Summary (Option B)				Summary (Option A)			
			McBaine-Perche Blue	Mill Creek - Grindstone Yellow	Mill Creek - Hinckson Red	Combined Total	Perche - McBaine Red-Blue-Green	Mill Creek - Grindstone Yellow	Mill Creek - Hinckson Red	Combined Total	Mill Creek - Grindsone Red	Mill Creek - Perche Green	Mill Creek - McBaine Green	Combined Total
Proximity to Residences	**12.5%**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**	
Houses 0-100		-10	-5,500	0	0	-5,500	-4,000	0	0	-4,000	0	-8,500	-7,750	-16,250
Houses 100-200		-5	-7,875	0	0	-7,875	-6,750	0	0	-6,750	-1,750	-11,250	-3,250	-16,250
Multi-Family 0-100		-10	-5,000	0	0	-5,000	-10,000	0	0	-10,000	-500	-6,750	-250	-7,500
Multi-Family 100-200		-5	-4,375	0	0	-4,375	-2,625	0	0	-2,625	-2,375	-6,500	-2,875	-11,750
Proximity to Residences TOTALS			**-22,750**	**0**	**0**	**-22,750**	**-23,375**	**0**	**0**	**-23,375**	**-4,625**	**-33,000**	**-14,125**	**-51,750**
Proximity to Day Cares, Schools, Churches, Hospitals, Nursing Homes	**11.3%**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**	
Day care 0-100		-10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Day Care 100-200		-5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	-118	-118	-236
Schools 0-100		-10	0	-708	-708	-1,416	0	-708	-708	-1,416	0	-708	0	-708
Schools 100-200		-5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Churches 0-100		-5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	-236	0	0	-236
Churches 100-200		-2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	-188.8	0	-189
Hospitals 0-100		-10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Hospitals 100-200		-5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Nursing homes 0-100		-10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Nursing homes 100-200		-5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Proximity to Schools TOTALS			**0**	**-708**	**-708**	**-1,416**	**0**	**-708**	**-708**	**-1,416**	**-236**	**-1014.8**	**-118**	**-1,369**
Proximity to Environmental Concerns	**11.8%**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**	
Wooded/forested crossed		-10	-2,008	0	0	-2,008	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Streams 0-200		-10	-1,888	-118	0	-2,006	-1,298	-118	0	-1,416	-236	-413	-177	-826
Conservation areas crossed		-10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Wetlands crossed		-10	-2,074	-118	-118	-2,310	-231	-118	-118	-467	0	-186.44	0	-186
Agricultural property crossed		3	5,228	0	0	5,228	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Proximity to Environmental Concerns TOTALS			**-743**	**-236**	**-118**	**-1,097**	**-1,529**	**-236**	**-118**	**-1,883**	**-236**	**-599.44**	**-177**	**-1,012**
Proximity to Recreation Areas	**11.7%**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**	
Parks 0-100		-10	-496	0	0	-496	-496	0	0	-496	0	-11.7	-11.7	-23
Parks 100-200		-5	-248	0	0	-248	-248	0	0	-248	0	0	0	0
Trails 0-100		-10	-42	0	0	-42	-14	0	0	-14	0	0	0	0
Trails 100-200		-5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Other recreation areas 0-100		-10	-468	0	0	-468	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Other recreation areas 100-200		-5	-234	0	0	-234	-316	0	0	-316	0	0	0	0
Proximity to Recreation Areas TOTALS			-1,488	0	0	**-1,488**	-1,075	0	0	**-1,075**	**0**	**-11.7**	**-11.7**	**-23**
Proximity to Businesses	**8.6%**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**		**Total impact**	**Total impact**	**Total impact**	
Commercial structures 0-100		-5	-215	-860	-1075	-2,150	-215	-860	-1,075	-2,150	-1,720	-1,290	-1,290	-4,300
Commercial structures 100-200		-2	-516	-688	-516	-1,720	-344	-688	-516	-1,548	-1,634	-1,376	-602	-3,612
Proximity to Businesses TOTALS			**-731**	**-1548**	**-1591**	**-3,870**	**-559**	**-1,548**	**-1,591**	**-3,698**	**-3,354**	**-2,666**	**-1,892**	**-7,912**
TOTAL LINEAL FEET PUBLIC FEEDBACK IMPACT			**-25,712**	**-2492**	**-2417**	**-30,621**	**-26,538**	**-2,492**	**-2,417**	**-31,447**	**-8,451**	**-37,292**	**-16,324**	**-62,067**
AVERAGE LINEAL FEET FEEDBACK IMPACT		-29,611												
COST	12.6%		$8,497,379	$1,493,798	$1,276,269	$ 11,267,446.00	$ 7,084,854.00	$ 1,493,798.00	$ 1,276,269.00	$ 9,854,921.00	$ 2,454,343.00	$ 5,590,202.00	$ 3,926,391.00	$ 11,970,936.00
COST COMPARISON ADJUSTMENT (Highest cost is 1)						0.94				0.82				1
COST COMPARISON ADJUSTED APPLIED TO PUBLIC FEEDBACK						0.119				0.104				0.126
COST AS A NEGATIVE PERCENT IMPACT OF TOTAL LINE FEEDBACK.						**-4,907**				**-4,292**				**-5,214**
LINE SCORE INCLUDING ADJUSTED COST COMPARISON						**-35,528**				**-35,739**				**-67,280**
Reliable Electric Service	16.2%		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0				15,912
Longest-Term Solution	15.3%		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0				15,028
TOTAL SCORE INCLUDING RELIABILITY AND LONG-TERM SOLUTION	100.0%					**-35,528**				**-35,739**				**-36,341**

Note: (Importance factors range from -10 to +10, with negative values indicating negative characteristics and positive values indicting positive characteristics.

DIAGRAM F