



City of Columbia, Missouri

Meeting Minutes

City Council

Monday, March 18, 2019

7:00 PM

Regular

Council Chamber
Columbia City Hall
701 E. Broadway

I. INTRODUCTORY ITEMS

The City Council of the City of Columbia, Missouri met for a regular meeting at 7:00 p.m. on Monday, March 18, 2019, in the Council Chamber of the City of Columbia, Missouri. The Pledge of Allegiance was recited, and the roll was taken with the following results: Council Members RUFFIN, TRAPP, SKALA, THOMAS, PITZER, PETERS, and TREECE were present. The Interim City Manager, City Counselor, City Clerk, and various Department Heads and staff members were also present.

The minutes of the regular meeting of February 4, 2019 were approved unanimously by voice vote on a motion by Mr. Skala and a second by Mr. Trapp.

The minutes of the regular meeting of February 18, 2019 were approved unanimously by voice vote on a motion by Mr. Skala and a second by Mr. Trapp.

The minutes of the regular meeting of March 4, 2019 were approved unanimously by voice vote on a motion by Mr. Skala and a second by Mr. Trapp.

Mayor Treece asked that B56-19 and R39-19 be removed from the consent agenda and moved to old business and new business respectively.

The agenda, including the consent agenda with B56-19 being moved to old business and R39-19 being moved to new business, was approved unanimously by voice vote on a motion by Mayor Treece and a second by Mr. Skala.

II. SPECIAL ITEMS

None.

III. APPOINTMENTS TO BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS

BC3-19

Board and Commission Applicants.

Upon receiving the majority vote of the Council, the following individuals were appointed to the following Boards and Commissions.

CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD

Seamon, Nicole, 413 N. Village Circle, Ward 5, Term to expire November 1, 2020

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

Wirges, Mindy, 4101 Big Sur Boulevard, Ward 4, Term to expire March 1, 2021

PUBLIC TRANSIT ADVISORY COMMISSION

Hoffman, Amanda, 1133 Ashland Road, Apt. 403, Ward 6, Term to expire March 1, 2020

TAX INCREMENT FINANCING COMMISSION

Seamon, David, 413 N. Village Circle, Ward 5, Term to expire September 1, 2022

Mayor Treece asked that the remaining two vacancies for the Tax Increment Financing Commission be readvertised.

Mr. Skala suggested they readvertise the vacancy for the Tobacco Retailer License Review Board in order to obtain more applicants so they had a choice in the appointment. Mayor Treece asked if there was any objection to that suggestion, and no one objected.

IV. SCHEDULED PUBLIC COMMENT

SPC18-19 Amy "Flo" Osborn - Public transportation.

Ms. Osborn explained she moved to Columbia in 1979 and helped in providing social services. She urged the Council to improve the public transportation system so there were more routes, it operated longer, there were more stops, etc. She provided examples of people affected by the bus system. She explained a teenage girl that had to leave her home because she had been the victim of physical violence was temporarily living with another relative across town from her school relied on the bus system to get to school and to work in the evenings. She noted the teenager was trying to find a place to live, and pointed out Columbia did not have any shelters for teenagers. There were times the bus was late, impacting her ability to get on the connecting bus, and this meant she had to utilize a taxi or Uber to get to work. Ms. Osborn stated the teenager already had to take a taxi or Uber to get home after work, and when she had to do it to get to work as well, all of her money was essentially going toward transportation. She explained another person she knew participated in the day treatment at a substance abuse center, which was only 3.5 miles from their home, but it took two hours to get there. Based on route times, many people were unlikely to be able to get to work at 8:00 a.m. because some of the routes involved picking people up after 6:00 a.m. In addition, many had to work evenings and weekends, and they were not being supported in terms of being able to get to work. She believed people would likely need fewer social services if they had reliable transportation to maintain a job and income. She understood the City did not provide all social services, but if they thought about all of the money of the organizations involved, it seemed as though public transportation would reduce costs while also providing people with dignity and respect since they would be able to earn money to meet their needs. She believed public transportation was a way to address equality and the other problems related to poverty, such as crime and blight. She stated she felt it was the right thing to do.

SPC19-19 Rebecca Shaw - How language/images on social media can impact public opinion re: community oriented policing.

Ms. Shaw explained she was the co-organizer of CoMo for Progress and would read a letter that was signed by eleven other organizations. The letter indicated the public had been asking leaders of the City of Columbia and the Columbia Police Department (CPD) to adopt community oriented policing practices for months and the Council had responded with a resolution for a department-wide community policing model. The citizens had waited in good faith over the past year for the release of the community oriented policing report, which was to include a summary of community input and direction for the community and police to work together toward the common goal of public safety. With the recent departure of both the city manager and chief of police, they hoped the new leadership would embrace the community oriented policing philosophy and instill in officers the belief that community oriented policing values could be practiced in their policing. In researching community oriented policing, they had come across several resources to include one that indicated a community oriented police department recognized that constructive action by police and community was always better than action by police alone, and the eleven signers of the letter felt that statement reflected the very basic element needed for the success of community oriented policing in Columbia. The letter continued by saying one way to assure buy-in from officers was to make sure

leadership was first exhibiting the qualities and values of community oriented policing. Interim Chief Jones had made strides in his first few weeks by displaying care and consideration for the public interest in policing. In discussions with officers, many seemed to be ready for change, and the groups involved wanted to see this change take root in the community, which meant they had to be aware of the influences on officers, positive and negative, from both inside and outside of the department. An important part of helping to increase the public trust with officers was to ensure images and languages associated with them made the public feel safe and reflected the philosophy of community policing. In addition to Lieutenant Tate's discriminating tweets and the Boone County Sheriff's now removed video, they felt recent posts, such as those made by the Columbia Police Officers Association (CPOA) were in poor taste and did not further the focus on community policing. The CPOA had released an image on social media featuring three uniformed officers stating "people sleep peacefully in their beds at night because rough men stand ready to do violence on their behalf," and the groups signing the letter hoped the leaders and officers could see how a statement like that along with other past posts could erode trust with the community and bring a warrior mentality to the forefront in the thinking of the public. A police force that believed it was their duty to do violence rather than protect and serve was a police force the community did not want and had actively advocated against. The groups signing the letter were asking City leaders to make a public statement reiterating support for community oriented policing, recommending the CPD and CPOA adhere to the same social media guidelines set for its officers, and assisting to arrange a facilitated meeting between the City, CPD, and CPOA leadership and community stakeholders to discuss why speech and social media content was important. They were ready to move the conversation forward and believed these actions would help progress the discussion of community oriented policing. She noted those that signed the letter were Central Latino, CoMo for Progress, Faith Voices of Columbia, Mid-Missouri Fellowship of Reconciliation, Mid-Missourians for Justice in Palestine, Mid-Missouri Peaceworks, Minority Men's Network, Race Matters, Friends, Social Action Team of the Unitarian Universalist Church of Columbia, Social Justice and Hospitality Team of Rock Bridge Christian Church, and Veterans for Peace-Charlie Atkins Chapter. She commented that this was a discussion that was happening nationally, and everyone needed to understand the strength of language and its effects on every individual. They wanted the officers to know how they were being portrayed by their leadership and for the public to know that all officers were not represented by these images. Those in power in the community should see how the images and messages were portraying them from all perspectives, and determine if it was helping or harming in the building of trust.

SPC20-19

Julie Ryan - COMO Safe Water Coalition - Columbia needs to end drinking water fluoridation for public health.

Ms. Ryan commented that while the COMO Safe Water Coalition first began its efforts to eliminate chloramine as a disinfectant in the drinking water, they quickly realized fluoride was another contaminant that needed to be addressed. She explained fluoride was reported in a three-year cycle for compliance purposes, and the number that had been reported using 2017 data was lower than the average in the wells. She noted the COMO Safe Water Coalition had questioned this and had been told the number that had been used for a compliance sample was from January 2015 when the plant had not been adding fluoride due to delivery issues. They wondered why that compliance sample would be used as they had not been adding the fluoride they had told the public they were adding. The compliance sample for 2017-2019 had been reported as 0.55 parts per million, which was a jump from the 0.25 parts per million that had been previously reported. She commented that on any given day no one in the public knew what the fluoride level would be in the water. She noted they understood the controversy with regard to the risks and benefits of fluoride and that there were studies linking fluoride to

Attention-Deficit/Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), loss of intelligence quotient (IQ) when the babies of pregnant women were exposed, and hypothyroidism, especially for those that were iodine deficient. While attempting to improve the health of one subset of the population, they could be contributing to negative health impacts of others. She wondered if one would encourage giving medication to a patient that had no human clinical trial for safety or effectiveness, something that had not been approved by the FDA for ingestion, or something that was labeled as an uncontrolled use of an unapproved drug in the drinking water as that was the industrial fluoride, i.e., hydrofluorosilicic acid (HFSA), that was being put into the drinking water. This type of fluoride additive meant a substance was being used as a medication and was being administered at the same dose to every citizen regardless of weight, age, health condition, or other medications being taken. She stated HFSA was a waste byproduct of fertilizer production and not a pharmaceutical grade product, and studies had found it to contain other hazardous elements, such as aluminum and arsenic. She noted fluoride itself was considered a contaminant by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) in terms of drinking water, and naturally occurring fluoride was insoluble and absorbed differently. HFSA was one of the most water soluble forms used in industrial applications to remove lead and was also known to be combined with chloramine to promote lead leaching. She commented that the Journal of Dental Research-Clinical and Translational Research had published a report on dental fluorosis trends in March of 2019, and according to the lead author, Chris Neurath, the extremely high rates were unprecedented and far beyond what was considered acceptable when water fluoridation had started 75 years ago. She noted data from the World Health Organization from 1970 to 2010 showed an overall decline in tooth decay in fluoridating and non-fluoridating countries and an article in the Scientific World Journal in 2014 indicated only about five percent of the world's population consumed artificially fluoridated water. She stated that recently Kentucky lawmakers had sponsored legislation that would allow communities to end water fluoridation as most of the communities in Kentucky participated in water fluoridation. In looking at data collected from 2001 and 2016, all but one region of the State had showed an increase in untreated tooth decay in third and sixth grade students, and the one region that had not shown an increase had remained stable. She wondered why there had been an increase in untreated tooth decay in a 15-year period if water fluoridation was so great. She referred to Sandy, Utah, where a malfunction had allowed undiluted HFSA to enter the drinking water system causing people to become ill and noted it was evidence of the dangers to which they could expose the public. She pointed out the best water treatment plant operators could not always control equipment malfunctions. She stated the COMO Safe Water Coalition believed Columbia was at a point where it could join other communities that did not fluoridate their water, and listed Springfield, Houston, Warsaw, Carl Junction, Sullivan, Waynesville, and Buffalo as some of those communities within Missouri. They believed it was time to join their neighbors in Boone County, Public Water Supply District No. 1 (PWSD1), and Ashland that did not fluoridate their drinking water, and to have a productive discussion of what they could do as a community to protect those that needed dental assistance without injuring those that did not.

V. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- PH8-19 Consider the FY 2018 Consolidated Annual Performance Evaluation Report (CAPER).
- Discussion shown with R40-19.
- R40-19 Approving the FY 2018 Consolidated Annual Performance Evaluation Report (CAPER); authorizing the City Manager to submit the document to the Department of Housing and Urban Development.
- PH8-19 and R40-19 were read by the Clerk.

Mr. Cole provided a staff report.

Mr. Trapp asked if the microlending program had involved the Central Missouri Community Action (CMCA) project or if there was another project. Mr. Cole replied it had been a general goal to do microloan projects, and CMCA had been the only entity that had applied for and received funds for those activities. He thought they had accommodated one loan in 2016 or 2017.

Mr. Skala understood those funds had been refunded. Mr. Cole explained those were general revenue dollars that had been allocated for that activity, and the funds had been returned as CMCA had struggled to find uses for them. He thought they would likely apply for funds for job training, which might be a better use of the funds for those efforts.

Mr. Skala asked about the owner-occupied rehabilitation program. Mr. Cole replied there had been more interest in smaller programs. In terms of the repair of existing housing, they had a small program that involved \$10,000 per homebuyer and a large program that involved \$35,000 per homebuyer. The minor home repair used involved about \$5,000, and there appeared to be more interest in the program once the limit had increased. He commented that people incurred debt on their homes in both programs and people seemed to be more comfortable with the smaller program. In addition, it took more time to do the larger projects.

Mayor Treece opened the public hearing.

There being no comment, Mayor Treece closed the public hearing.

Mr. Trapp commented that the CAPER pointed to the excellence of the City in this area. He thought they made good use of these federal pass-through dollars. They brought a sizeable local commitment that far exceeded the required match because issues of affordable housing and development in the lower income areas were important to the Council. In some years past, they had increased the administration amount in order to bring on additional staff. He felt this showed great cooperation between non-profits in the community, activities the City managed and operated, and things done through partnerships. He thought this spoke well of the community and that they had only started in terms of solutions compared to the needs they had. A high percentage of people were still cost-burdened, and if they wanted to address the fundamental economic equation of the community, they needed to take on actions that raised the wages of the people that lived in Columbia and created more affordable housing options.

The vote on R40-19 was recorded as follows: VOTING YES: RUFFIN, TRAPP, SKALA, THOMAS, PITZER, PETERS, TREECE. VOTING NO: NO ONE. Resolution declared adopted, reading as follows:

VI. OLD BUSINESS

B55-19 Authorizing the issuance of Special Obligation Refunding Bonds, Series 2019.

The bill was given second reading by the Clerk.

Mayor Treece understood the bonds had been sold today, and there was an amendment sheet that reflected the final pricing achieved.

Mr. Glascock provided a staff report.

Mayor Treece made a motion to amend B55-19 per the amendment sheet. The motion was seconded by Mr. Skala and approved unanimously by voice vote.

Mayor Treece asked what would be done with the savings. Mr. Glascock replied it would likely be utilized for future projects.

B55-19, as amended, was given third reading with the vote recorded as follows VOTING YES: RUFFIN, TRAPP, SKALA, THOMAS, PITZER, PETERS, TREECE.

VOTING NO: NO ONE. Bill declared enacted, reading as follows:

- B56-19 Authorizing a development agreement with Fred Overton Development, Inc. to establish public infrastructure obligations relating to the development of Bristol Ridge Subdivision located on the east side of Bearfield Road and north of Gans Road (Case No. 18-30).

The bill was given second reading by the Clerk.
Mr. Teddy provided a staff report.

Mayor Treece made a motion to amend B56-19 per the amendment sheet. The motion was seconded by Mr. Skala and approved unanimously by voice vote.

**B56-19, as amended, was given third reading with the vote recorded as follows
VOTING YES: RUFFIN, TRAPP, SKALA, THOMAS, PITZER, PETERS, TREECE.
VOTING NO: NO ONE. Bill declared enacted, reading as follows:**

VII. CONSENT AGENDA

The following bills were given second reading and the resolutions were read by the Clerk.

- B57-19 Authorizing a contract with Consolidated Public Water Supply District No. 1 of Boone County, Missouri for the relocation of water lines relating to the Nifong Boulevard/Sinclair Road and the Vawter School Road/Old Mill Creek Road intersections improvement projects.
- B58-19 Amending Chapter 14 of the City Code to prohibit parking along the south side of Orange Street, between Mikel Street and Madison Street.
- B59-19 Accepting conveyances for sidewalk, drainage, street, utility and temporary construction purposes.
- B60-19 Accepting conveyances for utility and electric utility purposes.
- B61-19 Appropriating funds for the major maintenance and replacement of existing lighting and underground electrical wiring in the Rainbow Softball Center parking lot at Columbia Cosmopolitan Recreation Area.
- B62-19 Appropriating funds for the replacement of the HVAC master controller at the Activity and Recreation Center (ARC).
- B63-19 Appropriating funds for the purchase of Light Detection and Ranging (LiDAR) data to update topographic information for mapping purposes.

- B64-19 Authorizing a first amendment to antenna agreement and memorandum of antenna agreement with USCOC of Greater Missouri, LLC relating to the lease of City-owned property located at 1400 Ballenger Place (Fire Station No. 5).
- B65-19 Authorizing a letter of agreement with the Missouri Department of Health and Senior Services, on behalf of the Bureau of Reportable Disease Informatics, relating to the enhancement of a statewide biosurveillance system for opioid deaths.
- B66-19 Authorizing a letter of agreement with the Missouri Department of Health and Senior Services, on behalf of the Bureau of Reportable Disease Informatics and the Bureau of HIV, STD, and Hepatitis, to organize and engage a stakeholder meeting in support of the development of new vulnerability assessments related to opioid overdoses and bloodborne infections associated with nonsterile drug injection; appropriating funds.
- B67-19 Authorizing construction to relocate a portion of Route H to allow for the extension of Runway 2-20 at the Columbia Regional Airport; calling for bids through the Purchasing Division; appropriating funds.
- B68-19 Authorizing a contract with Consolidated Public Water Supply District No. 1 of Boone County, Missouri for the relocation and upgrade of a water line along Route H near the Columbia Regional Airport.
- R36-19 Setting a public hearing: consider the installation of traffic calming devices on Primrose Drive between Stadium Boulevard and Sunflower Street.
- R37-19 Setting a public hearing: proposed installation of twenty-one (21) historical markers along the African-American Heritage Trail in public rights-of-way adjacent to sidewalks in the central portion of Columbia, a portion of the MKT Trail at Flat Branch Park and walkways within Columbia Cemetery.
- R38-19 Approving "Woodsong Preliminary Plat" located on the north side of St. Charles Road and west of Elderbrook Drive (Case No. 32-2019).
- The bills were given third reading and the resolutions were read with the vote recorded as follows: VOTING YES: RUFFIN, TRAPP, SKALA, THOMAS, PITZER, PETERS, TREECE. VOTING NO: NO ONE. Bills declared enacted and resolutions declared adopted, reading as follows:**

VIII. NEW BUSINESS

- R39-19 Authorizing an agency receipt/agent authorization contract with GunBusters, LLC for the destruction of firearms seized by or surrendered to the Police Department.

The resolution was read by the Clerk

Ms. Thompson and Interim Police Chief Jones provided a staff report.

Mayor Treece asked Interim Chief Jones for the number of confiscated firearms in the last year or in the last ten years. Interim Chief Jones replied he did not have those numbers. He pointed out there were days they would seize a dozen firearms. Mayor Treece understood the firearms would remain in the evidence room until the case was closed. Interim Chief Jones stated that was correct. He noted they were bulky and difficult to store.

Mayor Treece made a motion to amend R39-19 per the amendment sheet. The motion was seconded by Mr. Skala and approved unanimously by voice vote.

The vote on R39-19, as amended, was recorded as follows: VOTING YES: RUFFIN, TRAPP, SKALA, THOMAS, PITZER, PETERS, TREECE. VOTING NO: NO ONE.

Resolution declared adopted, reading as follows:

IX. INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING

The following bills were introduced by the Mayor unless otherwise indicated, and all were given first reading.

- B69-19 Approving the Final Plat of "Barkwell Subdivision, Plat No. 1-A" located on the southwest corner of the Nebraska Avenue and Providence Road intersection; authorizing a performance contract (Case No. 18-161).
- B70-19 Approving the Final Plat of "Spring Creek Plat 1A" located on the north and west sides of the western terminus of Cross Timber Court; authorizing a performance contract (Case No. 25-2019).
- B71-19 Authorizing Amendment No. 2 to the agreement for professional architectural services with Architects Design Group/ADG, Inc. for design services relating to the construction of the Molly Bowden Neighborhood Policing Center in the Auburn Hills Subdivision.
- B72-19 Authorizing an interim operating agreement with Skinny Labs Inc., d/b/a Spin, for implementation of a shared active transportation operation.
- B73-19 Appropriating grant funds received from the Missouri Department of Natural Resources Volkswagen Trust Transit and Shuttle Bus Program for the purchase of three (3) electric buses.

- B74-19 Approving the route of the African-American Heritage Trail; authorizing the installation of twenty-one (21) historical markers along the African-American Heritage Trail in public rights-of-way adjacent to sidewalks in the central portion of Columbia, a portion of the MKT Trail at Flat Branch Park and walkways within Columbia Cemetery.
- B75-19 Repealing Ordinance No. 023778 which authorized an agreement with Boone County, Missouri for public health services; authorizing a revised agreement.
- B76-19 Authorizing a memorandum of agreement with the Missouri Department of Health and Senior Services for access to the Missouri State Public Health Laboratory (SPHL) OpenELIS Web Portal.
- B77-19 Authorizing Amendment No. 2 to the program services contract with the Missouri Department of Health and Senior Services for public health emergency preparedness services; appropriating funds.
- B78-19 Appropriating funds for air service marketing and promotion services.
- B79-19 Appropriating funds relating to construction of Fire Station #10 (East).
- B80-19 Appropriating funds for the repair of Gas Generator #3 at the Columbia Sanitary Landfill.
- B81-19 Appropriating funds for the Columbia Police Department (CPD) facility improvement project.
- B82-19 Authorizing an equitable sharing agreement and certification with the U.S. Department of Justice and U.S. Department of the Treasury detailing FY 2018 receipts and expenditures of shared funds by the Police Department.

X. REPORTS

- REP26-19 Street trees within the public right of way - UDC text amendment.
- Mr. Teddy provided a staff report.
- Mr. Skala understood the next step would be to refer this to the Planning and Zoning Commission should Council agree. Mr. Trapp stated he thought that would be wise. Mr. Teddy noted it would be referred.

REP27-19 Letter from Public Transit Advisory Commission relating to transportation funding.

Mr. Glascock provided a staff report.

Mr. Skala understood this had been provided for informational purposes only.

Mr. Pitzer commented that he understood a concern with transit involved ending Saturday service this summer. In looking at the transportation sales tax numbers from 2018, it appeared as though they had come in at about \$11.8 million, which was about \$300,000 over the 2018 budget and provided a higher baseline for the current year. He understood there was also the potential that they could be over budget again. He noted that in a work session a few weeks ago they had been told the limited Saturday service for the rest of this fiscal year would cost roughly \$74,000 and would be around \$148,000 for all of next year. He was not sure if this was the amount the City needed to commit or if there might be federal matching funds for a portion, but suggested they look at using the surplus in the transportation sales tax to fund the limited Saturday service for the remainder of this year. In addition, when they reviewed the budget in the fall, they would hopefully have a better sense of surplus in that fund for the current year that could potentially be applied to fund that service for next year. He asked that this information be provided in the form of a report along with the other information that had been requested by Mr. Skala and others on this subject previously.

Mr. Pitzer understood comments had been made indicating cuts to funding for public transit and the lack of resources that had been put toward transit, and he wanted to make sure it was clear that the City had actually increased spending on transit from the transportation sales tax by over \$1 million over the past decade. It had been a larger increase than that for the airport, and since 2012, there had been a larger increase in terms of dollars in transit than the street maintenance program. He pointed out streets were consistently identified as the number one concern of citizens by a significant margin, and they had received a report a couple of meetings ago showing just how deteriorated some of the streets were within the City. He believed there was a potential solution for the limited Saturday service, but felt it was a misnomer to say the City had been cutting funding for transit. He noted costs and expenses were going up, but revenues were not going up at the same rate. Just this year, the changes they had made to the pay plan had increased costs for transit by about \$98,000. This was occurring in all of the other departments as well. He reiterated the City had dedicated a lot of resources to public transit and continued to dedicate a lot of resources to it. If the numbers came in as he anticipated, he suggested they use some of the surplus for the Saturday service and the remainder of those surplus funds for the annual street maintenance program.

Mayor Treece stated he liked the parity Mr. Pitzer had recommended with additional funds going into street maintenance as well as Saturday service.

Mr. Skala commented that he was warm to the idea suggested by Mr. Pitzer with regard to surplus funds. He explained he had previously requested information with regard to the transportation sales tax, which helped to fund the airport, transit, and roads. He understood about 50 percent went to roads, 25 percent to the airport, and the remaining 25 percent to transit. He explained his suggestion of 2.5 percent from roads and the airport had been an attempt to temporarily balance some very high priorities and to share the pain so no one took too much of a hit. He reiterated that would have only been a temporary measure and that they needed additional funding to adequately service all of the high priority items. He asked that the report staff would provide include how much money could potentially be yielded by each percent that was cut. He noted he also wanted the report to discuss the potential of going to smaller vehicles. He commented that he believed they would need to revisit the idea of an increase in the development fee to raise funding for roads as well.

Mr. Glascock stated he had received some information today. One percent of the

transportation sales tax generated about \$113,900. A reduction in street funding of 2.5 percent would provide about \$150,000 and a reduction in airport funding of 2.5 percent would provide about \$47,000, so that would total about \$197,000.

Mr. Glascock commented that they could probably provide Saturday service for the remainder of this fiscal year at a cost of about \$50,000, and they could utilize reserve funds if necessary. He noted he would need to know how the Council wanted to move forward fairly quickly because the schedules would soon be reprinted to remove Saturday service. If it was to remain, they did not want to waste \$10,000 reprinting schedules.

Ms. Peters asked how often the buses would run with Saturday service. Mr. Glascock replied he thought they involved 90-minute headways. Ms. Peters understood it would be 90 minutes instead of 45 minutes.

Mayor Treece commented that if they wanted to assimilate all of the transportation dollars, they should include some of the disincentives to riding the bus, such as parking meter fees, etc., to determine if all of it could work in tandem to fund a robust system.

Mr. Skala agreed and suggested charging for parking at some of the permanent lots at the airport. He explained he had recently traveled to New Orleans via a train from Carbondale, Illinois, and there had been a municipal lot next to the train station. It did not have a fancy gate to monitor compliance and only had a nominal \$2 per day fee. He commented that he did not want to ask for too much and wanted to allow for the sharing of the pain so the public understood the Council understood this was a priority, particularly for those that needed the most help. He believed that was another part of the equation that needed to be evaluated, but thought they could move quicker on the Saturday service for the remainder of the year as had been suggested by Mr. Pitzer.

Mayor Treece asked if there was any objection to restoring the Saturday service for the rest of this fiscal year while they continued to work on route changes and other adjustments. Mr. Thomas stated he was supportive. Ms. Peters noted she was supportive as well.

Mr. Pitzer stated he would be interested in seeing an appropriation of the FY 2018 surplus from the transportation sales tax to fund the Saturday service for the rest of this fiscal year, and for the rest of those funds to go into the annual street maintenance fund. Mayor Treece agreed he wanted to see funding for potholes to be a part of the solution as well. Mr. Glascock stated staff would bring back an ordinance for Council consideration.

XI. GENERAL COMMENTS BY PUBLIC, COUNCIL AND STAFF

Eugene Elkin, 3406 Range Line Street, commented that he was glad to hear something was happening with regard to transit, and believed they all needed to be empathetic. He noted it impacted people trying to work, and felt they needed to try to make it a 24/7 service. He stated he did not currently rely on the bus system, but understood he might be forced to in the future and wanted a system he could count on in case that occurred. He explained he had been a victim of the potholes and was glad to hear it was a priority.

Mr. Elkin understood more and more states were stopping the fluoridation of water and suggested the Council consider it as well if it was related to ADHD.

Steve Calloway, 3900 Sherman Court, explained he had been working with the United Way on their financial stability and economic mobility project that had involved visiting with community organizations in response to grant requests. In the summit held in November, the issue of transportation had come up. The businesses were indicating they could not find employees, and the employees that could potentially be employed were unable to get to the jobs that were available to them. There was an issue when employees were unable to show up for work. He noted there was a tie to financial stability as well because when people were unable to keep a job, they could not become financially stable or experience economic mobility up the chain. Some people did not have a car and others did not have a license or had a license that was suspended, and they might have to depend on the transportation system.

Mr. Calloway felt they needed to determine what type of transportation system might be required to fit the needs of everyone. One bus at a certain period of time might not be it. He noted the United Way had conducted a trial with Uber. He wondered if smaller vehicles might help or if businesses would work with them on providing transportation. He pointed out they might not ever be able to provide bus service in the normal traditional way for employment at some businesses with different shifts, such as second or third shifts. He encouraged the Council to think more broadly about how they might be able to meet the needs of Columbia's population and to not be stuck on trying to have buses in the traditional way.

Mayor Treece stated he agreed and asked Mr. Calloway if he had a sense of how many people in need of that service had a smart phone, which was required for on-demand type of services. Mr. Calloway replied that was not his area of expertise and noted he could think of many issues. Those with minute phones might be out of minutes and not be able to access the internet-type items necessary. He noted a lot of things had been discussed in terms of financial stability and he was not sure there was one solution.

Mr. Skala commented that the City had discussed the issue with the businesses along Paris Road and the University amongst others, and it was a real intractable problem. He agreed a solution was necessary, but felt in the short term, it would be incremental.

Mr. Calloway stated he agreed the potholes were a problem as well.

Ms. Peters understood Taxi Terry had some vehicles that were wheelchair accessible and wondered if anyone used those. Mayor Treece explained there had been a competitive RFP for three grants, but it could only be done one at a time. He wondered if there had been a reporting process as part of the grant. Ms. Peters commented that they heard from those utilizing paratransit with regard to transportation issues and wondered if they had availed themselves of that option.

Ms. Peters stated that she would be interested in knowing what United Way had found in their review of utilizing Uber because vouchers might be the way they decide to proceed if the buses were not used.

Ms. Peters appreciated Mr. Pitzer and Mr. Skala for trying to provide ways to continue Saturday service.

Mr. Thomas commented that he also appreciated his colleagues' attention to the transit concerns, and it appeared as though they might be able to keep Saturday service going through the end of this fiscal year. He hoped they could find a way to keep it going into the FY 2020 year. Without it, many people were literally homebound for the entire weekend, including those with disabilities that had access to Saturday service now, but would not if they ended fixed route services on Saturdays. He thanked the Public Transit Advisory Commission (PTAC) for their letter explaining the need to find a solution to the budget problem for transit. He urged them to not look at this as an attempt to fix the system to provide transportation service for people that did not own a car as he thought they needed to think a lot bigger than that. In looking around the world, transit systems worked well in places where a lot of people used them. It did not work in places where most people used a car and a few people used the transit service. He believed they needed to create a bigger vision for transit. He commented that he liked Mr. Calloway's idea of a broad vision as it was not just about buses. It included ride-hailing services, the flex route idea previously discussed, taxi cabs, etc. He believed they needed discuss the needs in the Columbia, to include those of the business community, the low-income community, the disabilities community, the climate action plan, the vision zero plan, the public health benefits, etc. He stated a number of benefits could be derived from a well-designed shared transportation program. He wanted to share his support for the idea of a larger conversation over the next twelve months or so to develop a vision and strategies they could afford in an effort to provide the transportation system they needed as a community.

Mr. Trapp noted the City was in its fourth year of a three-year strategic plan and January of 2020 might be the soonest they would further look into a new strategic plan. As a result, he wanted the staff that was overseeing the strategic plan to think about communicating and planning with their neighborhood partners in the strategic areas that were already engaged in the process and had expectations of an ongoing process to ensure they were not just going through the motions of meeting with people. He pointed out some things were better not to do at all than to not do well, and felt meeting with struggling folks and engaging them in a process was one of those things. He stated they had engaged people so he wanted to provide clear direction to staff that this was a live process that was ongoing. He asked that additional focus be provided to those efforts.

Mr. Trapp commented that the calm in Ward 2 had been disrupted with a number of shots fired incidents and shootings. The people in the neighborhood felt these were people that were coming from outside of the neighborhood. He stated he wanted to have a meeting with Glenn Cobbins, the neighborhood specialist for the City, as he wanted to compare notes with Mr. Cobbins as to what the issues might be and what they could potentially do to address them. He also asked that they look into a camera as it had been considered in the past. He understood a portable camera system would cost about \$40,000 and thought it would be nice if it was a part of the policing repertoire. He wondered if there was support to utilize the council reserve funds, and noted it could come back to them as a report. As a non-policing professional, he would never try to tell the Interim Police Chief how to spend limited resources within the police budget, but if they could provide additional resources, it would allow for an additional tactical option. In order to shoot-up Bodie Drive, one had to go past the corner of Edenton Boulevard and Bodie Drive. He understood this was likely a stop-gap need since a police station would be built at the next block, but it was a real problem now without it even being summer yet. When considering weather as a determinant with these types of activities and the fact it was only March, he felt something needed to be done. He asked if a camera could be looked into if it was a possible solution. He explained he was not a camera person, but it was an idea those in the neighborhood had and supported. He thought it was a deterrent to know license plate information could be captured. In addition, they would be able to move it to other areas. He asked for a report with regard to the cost and how quickly it could be implemented, and they could then determine if there was support for the use of council reserve funds for it.

Mr. Skala stated he believed it was a larger conversation than from where the funds would come. He commented that he spoke with Glenn Cobbins at a recent meeting and they had discussed the problem areas within Ward 3. He agreed a camera might be a solution, but thought a bigger conversation was needed.

Mr. Skala explained he had served with Ms. Ryan, who had spoken earlier, on the Drinking Water Planning Work Group, which had made recommendations in terms of the treatment plant, its capacity issues, chloramine, etc., and that the Group had taken the discussion very seriously after being provided a thorough review from the Board of Health with respect to fluoride. He understood some communities had shifted their thinking, but as far as he knew, Columbia had not. He stated he was not unwilling to continue the conversation, but wanted to ensure people understood Ms. Ryan's presentation had been one-sided toward a particular view.

Mayor Treece commented that he felt Mr. Trapp's concerns with regard to Bodie Drive were well-founded, but that he also did not want to give Interim Chief Jones a piece of equipment he did not want. One of the things they did last summer when there was a spike in gun violence downtown was to bring the downtown unit together along with the

downtown business owners. It had resulted in a productive conversation as to the choke points, what was provoking the issue, what the businesses were willing to do with respect to cameras on their buildings, lighting, etc. He noted it was easier for cameras to be installed by the private sector than the government imposing surveillance on its own people. There was not the same density of stakeholders on Bodie Drive, but there were people that cared about the neighborhood. He wondered if they should have the same dialogue and include others surrounding the neighborhood in addition to those in that neighborhood. He understood the camera might be the solution, but thought there might be other solutions with a larger dialogue.

Mr. Skala stated he recalled a discussion about cameras in the downtown, and at that time, the Council endorsed the idea of cameras in the garages and on public buildings and had been willing to help the private sector with camera needs. It had involved a public discussion of whether or not it was legitimate to have public surveillance on public sidewalks and public streets. He thought they might revisit that with this conversation and felt it was worth looking at all of the options.

Mayor Treece noted there were other technologies as well and preferred they not forfeit the opportunity to have a larger discussion.

Ms. Peters commented that this might be a discussion that was needed within the next 7-10 days since it involved shots fired.

Mayor Treece suggested Mr. Trapp reserve a conference room and get the stakeholders together with the police command staff or beat staff with the permission of Mr. Glascock to determine solutions. Mr. Trapp stated he was fine with that approach as long as it was something that was moving forward. Mayor Treece commented that he thought it would be quicker than bringing back a report, and noted it had worked for the downtown.

Ms. Peters stated she would be supportive of cameras if it was determined that would help. Mayor Treece noted he would be as well. He pointed out discussion could result in street lights being the solution instead, like in the downtown, or even other things.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Mayor Treece adjourned the meeting without objection at 8:20 p.m.