

CITY OF COLUMBIA

CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD 2014 ANNUAL REPORT

Table of Contents

Membership Information	1
History of Formation of the Citizens Police Review Board	2
Executive Summary	3
Summary of Appeals	4
Demographic Information on Complainants who Appealed to the Citizens Police Review Board.....	5
Analysis of Citizen and Police Complaints and Compliments.....	5
Community Outreach and Educational Programs	5
Recommendations on Police Policies, Procedures and Training	6
Additional Actions and Accomplishments.....	7
Conclusion	7

2014 MEMBERS OF THE CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD

Dr. James C. Martin, Chair
Gabriel Scott Dean, Vice Chair

Kathryn Busch (*Term began 11/2014*)
Andrew Fisher
Jordon Hargrove
Dr. Jerry Kennett
Stephen Sheltnire
Jeffrey Shelton (*Term began 11/2014*)
Jayne Woods (*Service began 09/2014*)

Dr. Stephen Alexander, Vice Chair – *Term expired 11/2014*
Roger Dowis - *Term expired 11/2014*
Betty K. Wilson – *Resigned 08/2014*

Subcommittee Membership:

Mediation Task Force Subcommittee:

1. Roger Dowis – Term expired 11/2014
2. Betty Wilson – Resigned 08/2014
3. Jerry Kennett
4. Scott Dean
5. Kathryn Busch – Term began 11/2014

Ordinance Review Subcommittee (*Subcommittee dissolved October 2014*):

1. Stephen Alexander
2. Scott Dean
3. Jordon Hargrove
4. Jerry Kennett

Outreach Subcommittee:

1. Roger Dowis – Term expired 11/2014
2. Andrew Fisher
3. James Martin
4. Steve Sheltnire
5. Jayne Woods – Service began 09/2014
6. Scott Shelton – Term began 11/2014

HISTORY OF THE FORMATION OF THE CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD

In 2007, a coalition of citizens and groups proposed the idea of creating a civilian review board to the City Council. The City Council appointed a fourteen member committee to study whether or not a review board was needed and to consider how such a board would be structured. The committee reviewed all complaints that existed before the professional standards unit was established. In addition, they studied and considered different models used by different cities, and hosted public events to gather input from the citizens. After extensive study and public input, the committee unanimously agreed to recommend that the City of Columbia establish a citizens police review board.

In July of 2009, the City Council of the City of Columbia, by adopting Ordinance No. 020331, created a nine member Citizens Police Review Board. The ordinance outlined the duties of the Citizens Police Review Board as follows:

The Citizens Police Review Board shall have the following duties:

- (1) Review appeals from the police chief's decisions on alleged police misconduct as provided for in this article.
- (2) Host public meetings and educational programs for Columbia residents and police officers.
- (3) Review and make recommendations to the police chief and city manager on police policies, procedures and training.
- (4) Prepare and submit to the city council annual reports that analyze citizen and police complaints including demographic data on complainants, complaint disposition, investigative findings and disciplinary actions. The reports should also describe the Board's community outreach and educational programs. The reports should also set forth any recommendations made on police policies, procedures and training. The reports shall be submitted no later than March 1 for the previous calendar year.

In 2014, the City Council, at the request of the Citizens Police Review Board amended Section 21-49, to add additional duties. Under the most recent amendments to the ordinance, the Board is also to conduct a jurisdictional review from the decision by the police chief that a person's allegations do not fall within the requirements set forth in the article related to complaints. The Board is also to conduct audits or reviews of the records of the police department for compliance with the requirements of the ordinances.

The City Council initially appointed the first eight members of the Citizens Police Review Board in November of 2009. Also in November of 2009, the Human Rights Commission

appointed its first member to the Board. The Board met for the first time on November 18, 2009.

Dr. Alexander, Dr. Martin, and Ms. Wilson served on the Board since its formation. Mr. Dean, the Human Rights Commission member, joined the Board in 2010. Dr. Kennett, Mr. Sheltmire and Mr. Dowis joined the Board in 2011. In 2012, the City Council appointed Mr. Hargrove. In 2013, the City Council appointed Mr. Fisher. In 2014, the City Council appointed Ms. Busch, Mr. Shelton, and Ms. Woods.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This annual report includes information on the Citizens Police Review Board's work from January 2014 through the end of December 2014.

Pursuant to its mandate, the Citizens Police Review Board's accomplishments include:

- (1) The Board reviewed appeals from the police chief's decision on alleged police misconduct. The Board also conducted a jurisdictional review of the police chief's decision.

During this reporting period, the Board received two (2) appeals. The Board also concluded one (1) appeal that was filed in 2013.

- (2) The Board hosted monthly public meetings with an opportunity for public comment at each regular monthly meeting, provided public educational programs on a variety of topics, and participated in community outreach.
- (3) The Board met with the police chief on two occasions (March 13, 2014 and September 10, 2014).
- (4) The Board is submitting to the City Council the following annual report which outlines the Board's actions from January 1, 2014 through December 31, 2014.
- (5) The Board has trained volunteer advocates to assist complainants and police officers with the complaint and appeal process.
- (6) The Board implemented a mediation pilot program with local attorney Lorri Kline under contract to provide mediation services.
- (7) Four Board members, Mr. Fisher, Dr. Martin, Mr. Dean and Mr. Sheltmire, were sent to the National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement national conference. Mr. Dean served as the City's voting member in the national organization.

- (8) Mr. Dean completed his training through NACOLE to become a Certified Practitioner of Oversight. Mr. Dean continues to serve on NACOLE's Website Committee.
- (9) The Board met with Dale H. Robert, CPOA Executive Director, at the Board's regularly scheduled August meeting.

SUMMARY OF APPEALS REVIEWED BY THE CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD

During this reporting period, the Board received two (2) appeals filed in 2014 and completed its review of one appeal filed in 2013. In the 2013 case, the Board unanimously voted to uphold the police chief's decision on the complaint. The Board also moved to recommend to the police chief that the police department provide additional training to police officers on policies regarding citizen's signatures on citations. On the first case filed in 2014, the Board conducted a jurisdictional review and concluded that the original complaint was timely filed and returned the case to the police chief for further review. The second case filed in 2014 is an appeal of the police chief's decision after he reviewed the case again.

The dispositions of the cases are summarized below.

<u>CPRB Case Number</u>	<u>Summary and Board's Action</u>
2013-0007	A person filed an appeal on December 13, 2013. After its review, the Board voted unanimously to uphold the police chief's decision. The Board also moved to recommend to the police chief that the police department provide additional training to police officers on policies regarding citizen's signatures on citations.
2014 -0001	A person filed an appeal on August 15, 2014. After a jurisdictional review, the Board passed a motion that the original complaint was timely filed and the police chief shall either conduct an investigation or refer the case to mediation. The motion passed with Dr. Alexander, Mr. Dean, Mr. Dowis, Mr. Fisher, and Mr. Sheltmire voting yes. Mr. Martin and Dr. Kennett voted no.
2014-0002	A person filed an appeal on October 14, 2014. This involves the same underlying complaint alleged by the same party in 2014-0001. The Board passed a motion that the complainant has not alleged sufficient facts, which even if true, would constitute misconduct within the definition of misconduct in Section 21-45 of the City Code. The motion passed with Dr. Martin, Ms. Busch, Mr. Hargrove and Mr.

Sheltnire voting yes. Mr. Fisher, Mr. Dean, and Ms. Woods voting against the motion.

**DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION ON COMPLAINANTS WHO
APPEALED TO THE CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD**

<u>CPRB Case Number</u>	<u>Demographic Information on Complainant</u>
2013-0007	w/m
2014-0001 & -0002	b/m

ANALYSIS OF CITIZEN AND POLICE COMPLAINTS AND COMPLIMENTS

At the time this report was prepared, the Board had not received a copy of the City of Columbia Police Department's 2014 Annual Report of the Internal Affairs Unit or its analysis of police and citizen complaints and compliments. When the Police Department provides the information and analysis of police and citizen's complaints and compliments to the Board, the Board will provide a supplemental report to the City Council.

**COMMUNITY OUTREACH AND EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS
BY THE CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD**

Section 21-49 of the City Code of Ordinances provides that the Citizens Police Review Board shall host public meetings and educational programs for Columbia residents and police officers. The Citizens Police Review Board hosted a regional conference in June of 2014. The Board also regularly met with police recruits to provide the new recruits with information about civilian oversight. The Board also used other avenues to increase community awareness and hosted speakers on civilian review topics at public meetings.

<u>Date</u>	<u>Topic</u>
February 12, 2014	Sgt. Chad Craig gave a presentation on the recruiting and training of police officers.
February 14, 2014	Mr. Dowis and Mr. Sheltnire met with one (1) new recruit during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.
April 20, 2014	Dr. Alexander, Mr. Fisher, and Mr. Sheltnire met with four (4) new recruits during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.

May 14, 2014	Ms. Karen Williams provided a presentation on the Kansas City Model of Civilian Oversight
May 20, 2014	Mr. Sheltmire met with two (2) new recruits during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.
June 21, 2014	CPRB members held a regional conference in Columbia, Missouri with guest speakers Dr. John Doggette, Executive Director of Community Mediation Services of St. Louis, Ms. Karen Williams, Office of Community Complaints in Kansas City, Missouri, and Mr. Martin and Ms. Wilson. The conference was attended by three different municipalities and citizens.
July 30, 2014	Mr. Sheltmire met with one (1) new recruit during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.
August 25, 2014	Mr. Dowis and Mr. Sheltmire met with four (4) new recruits during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.
September 15, 2014	Mr. Dean and Mr. Sheltmire appeared on a Paul Pepper Radio Show episode on KBIA.
September 2014	Mr. Dowis met with three (3) new recruits during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.
October 2014	Information regarding the CPRB is in the October 2014 edition of the City Source publication.
November 12, 2014	Assistant Chief Gordon gave a presentation on the police department's use of body cameras.
December 2014	Mr. Dean met with a student reporter from the Missourian to discuss body cameras.
December 17, 2014	Ms. Woods and Dr. Martin met with new recruits during the Police Department recruit training/orientation.

RECOMMENDATIONS ON POLICE POLICIES, PROCEDURES AND TRAINING

As part of its review of case number 2013-0007, the Board recommended to the police chief that the police department provide additional training to police officers on policies regarding citizen's signatures on citations.

ADDITIONAL ACTIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS

In addition to the actions and accomplishments outlined above, the Citizens Police Review Board also had the following accomplishments during this reporting period:

- (1) Working with the police chief, the Board established a mediation pilot program. Ms. Lorri Kline entered into an agreement with the city to provide professional mediation services for the resolution of police complaints.
- (2) The Board proposed changes to Chapter 21 of the City's Code of Ordinances. The City Council adopted the Board's proposed changes on July 21, 2014. These changes provide for additional civilian oversight of the police department by including oversight of complaints about community service aides, adding a jurisdictional review process, formalizing the use of mediation, and authorizing the Board to conduct audits or reviews of the police department records for compliance with the requirements of Article III of Chapter 21 of the City's Code of Ordinances.
- (3) Board member G. Scott Dean achieved NACOLE recognition as a Certified Practitioner of Oversight (CPO).
- (4) After discussions between the police department and the board, the police department designed a method for the Board to more easily review complaints and compliments, thereby providing more timely civilian oversight.
- (5) The Board reviewed and revised its bylaws.

CONCLUSION

During 2014, the Citizens Police Review Board achieved improvements to the civilian oversight process and, as a result, provided more civilian oversight of the police department. The Board proposed changes to Chapter 21 of the City's ordinances. The City Council approved these changes to the ordinances and as a result, there was an increase in the Board's duties, responsibilities, and civilian oversight. Additionally, in 2014, the Board implemented a mediation pilot project and selected, with the consent of the police chief, a local attorney and experienced mediator to provide professional mediation services for the mediation of police complaints. During this review period, the police department arranged for the Board to have secure access to complaints and compliments to allow for more timely civilian oversight.

The Board continues to value the importance of education in the civilian oversight process. In 2014, four board members attended the national conference of the National Association of Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement. One of the Board members was recognized as a Certified Practitioner of Oversight by the National Association of Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement. The Board also hosted its first regional conference of civilian oversight with speakers Dr. Doggett, Ms. Karen Williams, Ms.

Betty Wilson, and Mr. James Martin. The regional conference was attended by representatives from three cities and members of the public.

We look forward to continuing to provide the City with an external and independent process for the review of actual or perceived misconduct by police officers and community service aides of the City of Columbia's police department. It is our firm belief that increased police accountability to the community will foster community trust in the police department and as a result a safer and healthier community for all the citizens of Columbia. It is our honor to continue with this work.